

**Report**  
**Special Administrative Review Committee to Ganado Presbyterian Church**  
**January 17, 2009**

At its November 8, 2008 Stated Meeting the Presbytery of Grand Canyon took the following action:

Approved in accordance with Form of Government G-9.0408 a Special Administrative Review Committee, made up of five (5) members, to Ganado Presbyterian Church for the following reasons:

1. The session is reported to have taken an irregular action in approving the appointment of Volunteers in Mission who may not have the proper credentials and may have been removed from their responsibilities at a United Methodist Church Native American Mission;
2. There may be a pattern of actions on the part of the Clerk of Session in which he exceeds his authority;
3. The session, through its clerk, has stated that the Presbytery of Grand Canyon has not been helpful to them in seeking pastoral leadership since the retirement of their previous pastor Paul Stone.

In undertaking this Special Administrative Review the Committee is to determine (a) whether the session is properly exercising its responsibilities and (b) whether the presbytery has been helpful in assisting the session in securing appropriate pastoral leadership and (c) whether:

"The proceedings have been correctly recorded; (G-9.0409a.(1))  
 The proceedings have been regular and in accordance with the Constitution; (G-9.0409a.(2))  
 The proceedings have been prudent and equitable; (G-9.0409a.(3))  
 The proceedings have been faithful to the mission of the whole church; (G-9.0409a.(4))  
 The lawful injunctions of a higher governing body have been obeyed. (G-9.0409a.(5))"

Notwithstanding the above determinations and findings, this committee is empowered with wide discretion as to its manner of inquiry into and approach to carrying out its work. In completing its work, the Committee shall comply with all of the applicable provisions of the Form of Government with respect to the work of Special Administrative Review. This Special Administrative Review Committee is to report its findings and recommendations to the January 19, 2009 Stated Presbytery Meeting, may provide interim reports with findings and recommendations to the Session and Presbytery Council and may call for a Special Presbytery Meeting if it deems necessary.

The Presbytery authorizes the Moderator of the Presbytery to appoint the Members of the Committee.

On November 19, 2008 Moderator Rev. Art Campbell confirmed the appointment of the following to serve on the committee: Elder Roger Davis (CLP- Fort Defiance), Rev. Norma McCabe (Kayenta and First, Tuba City), Elder Jean Montgomery (Desert Palms), Elder Bill Noyes (Pinnacle) and Rev. Fran Park (HR).

On November 20, 2008 Dick Coffelt, Stated Clerk, sent background material to each member of the committee. Among the background papers were the following:

Paper P-4 Proposed Review Committee; Advisory Opinion Note 01 concerning Special Administrative Review; October 22, 2008 memo to Hank Haskie from Chuck Proudfoot, Session Moderator regarding an improperly called session meeting; October 27, 2008 series of emails concerning Benson and Lori Ndolo becoming VIMs; Email letter of October 29, 2008 from the Stated Clerk to Benson and Lori Ndolo; Email October 30-31 from Hank Haskie to Ken Moe asking that Ken convene and moderate a Special Session Meeting; Notice of and Agenda for Special Meeting of November 2, 2008 moderated by Chuck Proudfoot and attended by the Stated Clerk; Correspondence from the Four Corners Native American Ministry of the United Methodists Church concerning relieving the Ndolos of their

responsibilities along with the 8-page appeal of the decision by the Ndolos; Benson and Lori Ndolo undated letter to the Clerk of Session including a VIM application and information concerning Benson's qualifications; Email exchange between the Benson / Lori and Rev. Paul West, United Methodist; Series of emails from those supporting the Ndolos; Additional documentation requested and provided concerning Visa status; Mission Study of Ganado PC dated January 18, 2004; Memo from David Chin, COM and PNC liaison regarding delays in PNC work and Hank Haskie; Ganado PC Church Information Form; Email of November 17, 2008 to two session members and Chuck Proudfoot requesting a special session meeting to consider a Mr. Myers visiting from California as a VIM (this meeting did not take place).

The Stated Clerk made arrangements for committee member Norma McCabe (also a COM Member) to pick up the Ganado Session Records from the church secretary and bring them to the November 25, 2008 COM meeting. The records had previously been reviewed by Roger Davis and were subsequently provided members Bill Noyes and Fran Park for review and safe-keeping. A report on the review of these records follows later in this report.

Following opportunity for the committee members to review the background papers described above, as well as three of the committee members having reviewed the session records, a Convening Conference Call meeting was held on December 9, 2008. All five members of the committee as well as Ken Moe, Executive Presbyter, and Dick Coffelt, Stated Clerk, participated in the call. The conference call was convened by Dick Coffelt for the purpose of orienting the committee to its work. In addition, Ken Moe provided the committee with the information he received as a result of his discussions with the United Methodist Bishop concerning the release of Benson and Lori Ndolo from their work at the Four Corners United Methodist Ministry. Following orientation and the sharing of background information, upon urging by other committee members, Bill Noyes agreed to serve as Committee Moderator and Fran Park agreed to serve as Committee Clerk.

Following opportunity for discussion, the Committee agreed unanimously that the qualifications that Benson and Lori Ndolo possess are not sufficient, nor acceptable for them to serve in any leadership or volunteer capacity at the Ganado Presbyterian Church or with any Presbyterian Church on the Navajo Reservation. In order to confirm this decision, the Committee wrote the following letter to the Ganado Session:

The following letter, in addition to being sent to the Session Moderator through the US Postal Service, was also sent to the following email addresses: Proudfoot – [cpcstudy@localnet.com](mailto:cpcstudy@localnet.com) and the Ganado Session - [Ganado\\_pc@citlink.net](mailto:Ganado_pc@citlink.net)

December 10, 2008

The Rev. Chuck Proudfoot, Moderator  
Ganado Presbyterian Church, Ganado, Arizona  
% Community Presbyterian Church  
800 W. Main Street  
Payson, AZ 65441

Dear Rev. Proudfoot and Members of the Ganado Session,

As a result of the action of the November 8, 2008 Presbytery meeting a Ganado Special Administrative Review Committee was approved. Presbytery Moderator, Rev. Art. Campbell, appointed the following members to serve: Elders Roger Davis (CLP-Fort Defiance) Jean Montgomery (Desert Palms), Bill Noyes (Pinnacle) and Revs. Norma McCabe and Fran Park.

The Committee has reviewed, studied and deliberated regarding one issue that needs to be corrected immediately by the Ganado Session related to the status of Benson and Lori Ndolo:

- 1) The initial decision to select Benson and Lori Ndolo as volunteers in mission by three session members, including the Clerk of Session, on behalf of the entire session, was without proper authority.
- 2) The session members acting on behalf of the session failed in their due diligence responsibilities to perform required background and reference checking before asking someone to serve in a leadership capacity.
- 3) While Mr. and Mrs. Ndolo subsequently provided information regarding their qualifications and experience, the Special Administrative Review Committee has determined that the qualifications they do possess are not sufficient nor acceptable to serve in any leadership or volunteer capacity at the Ganado Presbyterian Church or with any Presbyterian Church on the Navajo Reservation.

Therefore the Committee has determined that Benson and Lori Ndolo are not authorized to occupy the Ganado manse and the Committee is recommending that they leave the Ganado manse no later than December 31, 2008.

If such steps are not taken by the Ganado Session the Special Administrative Review Committee will ask that a special meeting of the Presbytery of Grand Canyon be called to act on this report and proceed with recommending to the presbytery that it exercise its responsibility under Form of Government G-11.0103(s) to assume original jurisdiction of the session and appoint an administrative commission with the full power of the existing session. Such power would include clarifying all related issues and taking appropriate action to have Benson and Lori Ndolo vacate the church property.

As Moderator of the Session, you are asked to call a special meeting of the Ganado Session and to inform them of these actions and recommendations of the Ganado Special Administrative Review Committee so that they may take immediate action to carry them out. The Rev. Norma McCabe, a member of the Special Administrative Review Committee, has agreed to attend this meeting to convey any further information in English as well as Navajo, therefore please coordinate the calling of this meeting with Rev. McCabe.

The Special Review Committee expects this specially called meeting of the Ganado Session to be held as soon as possible and a report to the Presbytery to be given immediately upon its conclusion.

The Special Review Committee will be engaging in further assistance to the Ganado Session, following the implementation of these recommendations, in regard to enabling the Ganado Church to receive the proper training and leadership to allow them to fulfill their historic ministry with the Navajo people.

Very sincerely,

William E. Noyes, Moderator, Ganado Special  
Administrative Review Committee

While the Session Moderator has made several attempts to call for a Special Meeting, the Session as of December 31, 2008 has failed to act on the above request. A courtesy copy of the above letter was provided to Benson and Lori Ndolo. On December 27, 2008 Benson and Lori authored a lengthy report on their work at Ganado including inviting youth from the Four Corners United Methodist Ministry to Ganado and indicating that Benson has preached at several Ganado worship services and talked of other work they planned to do. The Session Moderator, Chuck Proudfoot, a recipient among many others to their emailed report, wrote a letter to

them indicating that they obviously had exceeded the authority and responsibilities approved by the Session at the special meeting and told them to cease work at Ganado and prepare to vacate church property by January 1, 2009. Benson and Lori have subsequently sent a letter in reply taking exception and pleading their case that they are qualified to serve.

With respect to the review of Session Records the books and records of the Ganado Presbyterian Church, consist of 3 documents, 2 church registers and one minutes book. The book has minutes from February 11, 1993 thru March 5, 2008. Three members of the committee (Elder/CLP Roger Davis, Rev. Fran Park, and Elder Bill Noyes) have reviewed the records in accordance with our charge from the Presbytery as members of the Committee. Our review has been limited as the records are incomplete. Our findings are as follows:

1. No new members have been posted since November 8, 1998, however Baptisms have been posted thru May 6, 2007: marriages have been posted thru June 30, 2007 and July 19, ????, as no year is recorded: and deaths have been posted thru July 17, 2008

Note: While no new members have been posted since 1998 a review of the number of members as reported in Part IIA Statistics for each General Assembly of the PCUSA reflect Ganado Presbyterian Church's membership as follows:

For the Period 12/31/98 – 12/31/02	73 Members
For the Period 12/31/03 – 12/31/05	76 Members
For period ending 12/31/06	21 Members
For period ending 12/31/07	20 Members

2. The last minutes in the minutes book are dated Wednesday March 5, 2008 and list 11 elders by name, the Clerk of Session and a Moderator. Rev. Chuck Proudfoot is shown as moderator in the opening prayer and Hank Haskie signed the minutes as Clerk of Session.
3. We were able to identify that 10 of the elders were members but were unable to identify that one individual was on the membership rolls. In addition we were unable to find any record of Hank Haskie being received as a member, or being elected an Elder to serve on the Ganado Session or as its Clerk of Session. The only mention of Mr. Haskie serving in that capacity is in 2001 where he was appointed temporary clerk until the next congregational meeting, however we were not able to find any record of the congregational meeting. Mr. Haskie has signed the minutes on many occasions since that date as Clerk of Session.
4. At a Session Meeting on March 5, 2001 the Session Voted to not hold an election of new elders until a new pastor had been called, therefore new elders have not been elected since that meeting.
5. It should be noted that the Rev. Paul Stone served as Pastor to the Ganado Presbyterian Church from May 31, 1983 until his Honorable Retirement effective November 1, 2003

The Special Administrative Review committee is continuing its efforts to work with the Session Moderator, in order that the Session has an opportunity to act on their own, on our request of them rather than have intervention by the presbytery. We will report on these efforts during our report at the January 17, 2009 Presbytery Meeting. In the meantime the Committee is aware of a candidate to be a Commissioned Lay Pastor, who was recently approved by the Presbytery's combined CLP/COM committee, who is willing and anxious to serve the Ganado Presbyterian Church. Our Committee will be holding at least one more meeting prior to January 17, 2009. On our agenda will be discussion, based upon all we know at this point in time, whether or not to recommend that the Presbytery assume original jurisdiction of the Ganado Presbyterian Church Session in accordance with Form of Government provision G-11.0103(s).